Oliver Mechcatie (Autor)

Pictures of the catastrophe and catastrophic pictures
Through the theoretical perspectives of Günter Abel, Roland Barthes and Ulrich Baer an analysis of the pictorial production on the occasion of the 9/11 catastrophe in New York and the concept of trauma within this production, as exemplified by the “New York Times” and “Immediate Damage” archives
Table of contents

Abbreviations 12

Introduction: A general statement concerning The New York Times and Immediate Damage as two “communities of images” 13

Example. Picasso cut-out and pedestrians fleeing: The first two pages of “The Arts Page” E1 & E2 on 9/13 14

The first gap: The step from the photograph as analogous reproduction to the art work to a pictorial sign of reality 28
The second gap: Going beyond the ‘just there’ in the photograph 32

Example: Pictorial descriptions of the A1 9/12 and a Portraits of Grief page of the New York Times 42
A general description of the first page of the New York Times catastrophic production 42
A detailed description of the A1 headline photograph 45
Structural overlapping of the Brooklyn Bridge and the World Trade Center Towers 46
The ‘empty’ area between the two Towers 47
The suspension of the bridge and the area beneath it 48
Summary of the general description of the first page of the New York Times catastrophic production 48

The Portraits of Grief (the PoGs): Emergence and crystallization 49
Example. Two covered faces: the fireman of A1 9/13 and the veiled woman of A19 9/13 as beginning indicators of the development of the Portraits of Grief page 50
The posters become grief: A8 of 9/14 & p.6 of 9/16 57
A1 9/12 is brought into comparison with A11 9/15, the first Portraits of Grief column 60
The pyramid-like hat as motif 64
**Focusing on Abel, Barthes and Baer 66**

**Part I: Focus on Günter Abel 68**

The inevitable loss of the immediacy of the pictorial sign and the pictorial sign as being differentiated from, but invariably influenced by, the spoken sign 69
The world-picture as a state of contingency as a heightened element in the pictorial sign 70
Meaning *something* 73
The 9/11 pictorial production as being ‘in the act of’ 74
The pictorial sign hangs in the museum and the picture marks the exit 75
The pictorial sign within the framework of the pictorial turn within a textual culture and the ‘bringing up’ of the ‘background’ of the world picture in order to see 78
The ‘bringing up’ as a kind of jarring of the perception 79
The space in which the spoken and unspoken sign meet 79
Art history as the science of this meeting between the spoken and the unspoken pictorial sign 81
Polarizing the possibilities inherent within the pictorial sign within the context of the pictorial turn 83
Seeing is doing 85

**Part II: Focus on Günter Abel and Roland Barthes 87**

Introduction to key concepts used in Abel’s “Zeichen der Wirklichkeit” 88
Abel and the background 90
The state of suspension 90
Navigating between the transformed photograph, the evidentiary photograph and the faded photograph in the 9/11 productions focused here 94
The daguerrotype as photographic essence 96
Denotational aspects of the photograph 97
The realization of the photograph as pictorial sign in terms of the ineffable and the denotational as carrying aspects of the trauma as a corrective in seeing 98
The sign of reality/ *Das Zeichen der Realität* 99
The ‘how’ of the ipso facto sign 100
Commonalities between Barthes and Abel 102
Trauma and the daguerrotype 104
System of interpretation 105
Abel's use of the concept of exemplification and the Barthian detail 106

Examples: The realization of the photograph as illustration and as art as a fundamental contradiction 107

The immediacy of time and place and the lost sign 108
The ineffable as an affixing state of suspension 109
A further explication of Abel's concept of the ineffable 112
The trauma of interpretation 117
Further questions 120
Developing the application of the trauma concept further through the application of Werner Bohleber 121
Werner Bohleber’s overview of the trauma concept 123
Moving the trauma concept into pictures 125
The Portraits of Grief as the ‘mute zones’ 125
Conclusion 128

Part III: Focus on Roland Barthes 129
The setting-up of analogies between pop art, art photography and the naked photograph 130
“That Old Thing, Art…” 130
Barthes’ characterization of pop art 130
Pop art as offering parallels with the photograph 131
The meaning of the image and the photograph as pop art 133
The essence of the essence held in analogy between photography and pop art 137
A1 9/12 as launching a ‘play’ of meaning 139
Evidence as the return to meaning in the portrait 141
Kitsch as seeing 142
The degree of aesthetic intensity as a “carnival of contradictions” 143
The (re-)emergence of naiveté as a pure seeing 144
The carnival of contradictions 145
The glowing limb in the New York Times 146

Part IV: Focus on Ulrich Baer 149
Baer’s orientation towards Barthes and his explication of the trauma in the pictorial description 149
Baer’s descriptive analysis of ‘primary’ and ‘secondary’ photographs of the Holocaust in relation to the pictorial analysis carried out in relation to 9/11 153
Baer’s approach to the primary photograph (or those taken during the Holocaust) and what this orientation has to offer the pictorial analyses 155
An early interpretation of history applied to the concept of trauma and photography as the medium to express this trauma within the frame of the historical 158
Flatness versus frontality as the illustration versus the realization of the evidentiary force of photography 160
Looking back as the detail which pricks 161
The Democritean “swirl of atoms in a void” as a state of suspension in pictorial terms 164
The world picture as suspended between being confirmed by the pictorial production or being defined by a serial production, which determines it as a compound picture reducible to its parts 167
The Portraits of Grief as expressed in the terms laid out above as the expression of the trauma in the pictorial production 169
The Portraits of Grief as a compound picture 170
The Portraits of Grief as necessarily complementary forms to A1 9/12 of the New York Times in the dynamics of the pictorial production as outlined here 171
Mario Erdheim and the implosion of the ‘mechanism’ of identification within the social hierarchy 174
The place of the aesthetic component in the evocation of the trauma 177
Conclusion: Final points 178
Example. The ‘Manet photo’: The ‘faded illustration’ between A1 9/12 and the definitive Portraits of Grief page 181
B14 9/21 as a memorialization that involves a monumentalization of motifs as a painting 182
Example. Manet before the vanishing point area: The recessive feminine versus the canalized framing of the feminine in choreographed militaristic forms through a comparison between B14 9/21 and a feature photograph on the Portraits of Grief page of B15 9/21 185

Sources 190
Printed sources 190
Pictorial sources 195
Electronic sources 195

List of figures 196
Figures 205